

Hegel, Marx & Vygotsky
Essays on Social Philosophy

By
Andy Blunden

2021

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	xi
Analytical Contents List	xiii
Introduction	1
* * *	2
1. What is the Difference Between Hegel and Marx?.....	5
The main difference between Hegel and Marx is the times they lived in	5
The Young Marx vs. Hegel on the state	6
Hegel and Marx on universal suffrage	8
Marx and Hegel on the state.....	9
Hegel’s misogyny	10
Hegel’s failure to see the contradiction in the value of commodities.....	10
Universal suffrage and participatory democracy	11
In what sense was Hegel an idealist?	11
(a). Hegel described himself as an Idealist.....	12
(b). Hegel emphasised the active side rather than passive contemplation	12
(c). Hegel took the social elite to be the agents of change	13
(d). Hegel believed that institutions tend to be true to their concept.....	14
(e). Hegel minimised the effect of mundane relations on institutions	14
(f). Hegel overestimated speculative reason relative to social process itself.....	15
Turning Hegel on his head	16
Goethe, Hegel and Marx.....	17
Activity and concepts	18
The Method of Political Economy	18
The commodity.....	19
Unit and germ cell.....	20
The Urpraxis is the ‘simplest social form’	20
‘Everything’ vs. a Gestalt.....	21
Commodity and capital.....	21
Summary	22
2. The Unit of Analysis and Germ Cell in Hegel, Marx and Vygotsky.....	23
Part I: From Goethe to Marx	23
Origins of the concept of “cell” as a method of analysis	23
Hegel’s formulation of the idea	24
The One	26
Marx’s appropriation of Hegel	27
The unit of capital	28
The development of science	28
Hegel on mediation and immediacy	29
Part II: Vygotsky and Activity Theory.....	29
Vygotsky on the method of double stimulation	29
Word meaning	31
Concepts as units of the intellect	32
The formation of concepts	33
Germ cell and unit of analysis.....	34
Five applications of the method of analysis by units	35
The importance of Vygotsky for social theory.....	37
A note on reification and units of analysis.....	37

Marx's Capital.....	37
Vygotsky's Thinking and Speech	39
3. Concrete Historicism as a Research Paradigm.....	41
Structuralism and abstract historicism	41
Logic and history in Hegel.....	42
Logic and history for Marx	44
Logic and development for Vygotsky.....	46
Logic and history for Foucault	47
Concrete historicism	48
Units of analysis.....	49
The germ cell	49
Conclusion.....	51
4. <i>Perezhivanie</i> as Human Self-creation.....	53
Introduction.....	53
No mystery.....	53
An experience.....	54
Etymology.....	55
Catharsis.....	55
Personality.....	57
Continuity and discontinuity	58
Unity.....	58
Lived experiences.....	59
Units	60
Development	60
Reflection.....	61
Examples.....	62
Critiques.....	63
<i>Perezhivaniya</i> on the social-historical plane	64
Conclusion.....	65
5. Agency	67
The domains of self-determination	67
Free will.....	68
The natural will.....	69
The development of the will in childhood	70
Self-control	71
Acquisition of ideals.....	72
<i>Perezhivaniya</i>	72
Freedom and the state	73
Voluntary association	74
Alliance politics	75
Conclusion.....	75
6. Tool and Sign in Vygotsky's Development.....	77
Part 1: <i>Ape, Primitive Man and Child</i>	77
History and evolution	79
Periodisation of the intellect	79
Periodisation of tools	80
Tools and the mind: Technical tools and psychological tools.....	81
Vygotsky's periodisation of word use in "primitive man"	82
Lines of development differentiate and interact.....	85

Instrumental Psychology: history or method?	86
Part 2: Tool and sign in Vygotsky after 1930	87
The instrumental method in psychology.....	87
History of Development of Higher Mental Functions	88
Thinking and Speech.....	90
Part 3. Marx, Engels, Vygotsky and the Marxist tradition.....	91
Marx and Engels on 'Just So stories'	91
Labour and language.....	92
A.N. Leontyev on labour and tools.....	93
Tools and operations in activity theory.....	94
Postscript: Engels and Vygotsky	95
Conclusion.....	96
7. Vygotsky's Theory of Child Development.....	97
The concepts of Vygotsky's periodisation.....	97
Social situation of development	97
Central neoformation	100
Lines of development.....	101
Age levels	101
Self-relation and the crisis periods.....	102
'Leading activity' and Zone of Proximal Development	103
8. The Concept of Object.....	107
The various concepts of object.....	107
Hegel's <i>Objekt</i> and <i>Gegenstand</i>	107
Objective and universal.....	108
Marx's critique of Hegel and Feuerbach	109
<i>Arbeitsgegenstand</i> – the object to be worked upon.....	110
The imagined and desired state of the world	111
The problem of 'objective motives'	111
The object is consumed and reproduced.....	112
Object-concept.....	113
Boundary objects.....	114
The object of a project	115
Conclusion.....	116
9. Leontyev's Activity Theory and Personality	117
Part 1. Objects and activities in Leontyev's activity theory.....	117
Problems in Leontyev's conception of 'activity'	118
Motivation	119
Objectivism	121
The object	121
Personal sense	122
Ideology.....	123
Particularity	125
(a) Dogmatism	128
(b) Functionalism.....	128
(c) 'Productivism'	129
Part 2. Leontyev's theory of the personality	129
Part 3. A 'project' as an activity	131
10. Fedor Vasilyuk's Psychology of Life-projects	133
<i>Otnoshiniye</i> (отношение)	133

The Lifeworld (жизненный мир)	134
<i>Perezhivanie</i> (переживание)	135
Types of <i>perezhivanie</i>	136
Social theory	137
11. The Invention of Nicaraguan Sign Language.....	139
Introduction.....	139
Vygotsky on the ideal form.....	140
Deaf children in Nicaragua.....	141
The effect of the 1979 revolution	142
APRIAS (Association to Help and Integrate the Deaf).....	144
Was ANSNIC acting alone?	146
Minimal conditions for acquisition of a sign language	147
Minimal conditions for the formation of a new sign language.....	147
In what sense may the case of NSL be generalised?.....	148
Village Sign Languages.....	148
Deaf Community Sign Languages.....	148
The development of language communities	149
Goldin-Meadow on the structure of personal sign.....	150
Conclusion.....	153
12. Language in Human Evolution.....	155
The co-evolution of animal behaviour and biology.....	155
Bipedalism.....	156
Carrying things.....	158
Delayed gratification.....	158
Abstraction.....	159
Gesturing.....	160
Voluntary control and conscious awareness	160
Gesturing again.....	162
Speech.....	162
Music and dance.....	163
How did our primate ancestors think?.....	163
Tool making	164
Collaborative projects.....	164
Writing.....	165
Art	166
Conclusions.....	166
13. Power, Activity and Human Flourishing	169
Collaborative project as a unit of social life	169
The abuse of power.....	171
Institutions	174
Firms	175
The human subject	176
Political economy.....	177
14. Vaccine Hesitancy	179
Risk culture and healthism.....	179
Trust	180
The 'VH compass'	180
The 1976 Swine Flu scare at Fort Dix.....	181
Whooping Cough vaccine scare in UK, 1977	181

MMR vaccine scare in UK, 1998	182
Polio vaccine boycott in Nigeria, 2003.....	182
H1N1 vaccine dispute in Europe, 2009.....	182
Persuasion and decision-making	183
Collaborative projects.....	185
The origins of vaccine scepticism	186
Conclusion.....	190
Postscript 2020	190
15. Something Worth Dying For?	191
Foreign fighters.....	191
Islamism and the duty of the individual Muslim	191
Who is fighting?	193
Who wants to be a foreign fighter?	194
Collaborative projects.....	196
Conclusion.....	198
16. <i>Capital</i> and the <i>Urpraxis</i> of Socialism.....	199
Preliminaries.....	199
I. Goethe, Hegel, Marx, Vygotsky.....	199
Part II.....	201
17. Virtue and Utopia	205
Internal goods.....	206
Problems with MacIntyre's virtue ethics	207
Consequentialism and deontology.....	208
Virtue ethics	208
Practical anarchism and virtue ethics.....	209
Goals and motives.....	211
Ethics and Utopia.....	211
The virtues of practices	213
Anarchism and mediation.....	213
Anarchist anthropology	214
Summary	214
The question of delegation and hierarchy.....	215
Conclusion.....	215
18. The Origins of Collective Decision Making (Synopsis).....	217
The question	217
Research methodology	217
Collective decisions without voting	218
Counsel.....	218
Where did Majority come from?	219
Origins of Majority.....	220
The development of majoritarianism	221
Crisis of majoritarianism.....	222
The Quakers and Consensus.....	222
Myles Horton and Consensus in SNCC.....	223
James Lawson and Consensus in SNCC.....	224
Women Strike for Peace.....	225
1968 and after.....	225
Conclusion.....	226
Postscript	226

19. False Heroes and Villains	229
Villains and false heroes	229
John Howard	230
The right-wing populist narrative	231
An alternative left-wing narrative	231
20. Amartya Sen on Critical Voice and Social Choice Theory	233
The critique of distributive justice	233
Amartya Sen	233
Human needs and social justice	234
Wealth	234
Functioning	234
Capability	235
Voice	235
Critical voice	236
Utilitarianism and Positivism	238
Utilitarianism and the real ethic of bourgeois society	239
Sen's critique of social choice theory	240
Conclusion	242
21. Comments on 'Social Capital'	245
22. Nancy Fraser on Welfare Dependency	249
Pre-capitalist society	249
Wage labour	250
Domestic labour	252
Public assistance	252
Universal and targeted benefits	254
Dependency as a personality trait	254
Building capacity vs. philanthropy	255
The ideology of self-help	256
23. Anthony Giddens on Structuration	259
The knowledgeability of social actors	260
Routines	261
Practical consciousness	262
Concepts and motives	264
Unintended consequences and conceptual development	265
Institutions and social movements	266
Conclusion	266
24. Bourdieu on Status, Class and Culture	269
Capital	269
Field and habitus	271
Class and habitus	271
Cultural capital and educational capital	272
Social capital, body capital, linguistic capital, political capital	273
Cultural relativism	273
Idealism	274
Political opinion formation	275
Systems of status subordination	276
Social capital theory	276
Axel Honneth's criticism of Bourdieu	277
Subjectivity	277

Conclusion.....	278
25. The Coronavirus Pandemic is a World <i>Perezhivanie</i>	279
26. As of 2020, the American Century is Over.....	283
References.....	289
Index.....	297